DOCKET FILE COPY ORIGINAL

RECEIVED

SEP 1 7 1998

September 17, 1998

FEDERAL COMMUNICATIONS COMMISSION
OFFICE OF THE SECRETARY

Ms. Magalie Roman Salas Secretary Federal Communications Commission 1919 M Street, NW Room 222 Washington, DC 20554

Re: Motion of AT&T Corp. to Strike Portions of BellSouth's Reply Evidence CC Docket No. 98-121

Dear Ms. Salas,

Enclosed please find a diskette formatted in WordPerfect 5.1 in a read-only mode containing the Motion of AT&T Corp. to Strike Portions of BellSouth's Reply in the above captioned proceeding.

Yours truly,

Anisha Anne Abrol

hisher copie Abel

No. of Copies rec'd__ List A B C D E

RECEIVED

Before the FEDERAL COMMUNICATIONS COMMISSION Washington, D.C. 20554

SEP	1	7	1998
-----	---	---	------

In the Matter of)	OFFICE OF THE SECRETARY
Second Application by BellSouth)	
Corporation, BellSouth Telecommunications,)	CC Docket No. 98-121
Inc., and BellSouth Long Distance,)	
Inc., for Provision of In-region)	
InterLATA Services in Louisiana)	

MOTION OF AT&T CORP. TO STRIKE PORTIONS OF BELLSOUTH'S REPLY EVIDENCE

AT&T Corp. ("AT&T") respectfully submits this motion to strike portions of the reply evidence submitted by BellSouth Corp. et al. ("BellSouth") on August 28, 1998.¹ In its reply brief and affidavits, BellSouth has once again submitted post-application evidence in violation of the Commission's rules for section 271 applications.² If it had the opportunity to do so, AT&T would demonstrate that this "evidence" is misleading,

¹ Exhibit 1 to this motion lists the improper material submitted by BellSouth.

² This Commission has previously and repeatedly held, both in establishing and enforcing procedural requirements for section 271 applications, that "'a section 271 application, as originally filed, will include all of the factual evidence on which the applicant would have the Commission rely in making findings thereon.'" Order, In the Matter of Application by Ameritech Michigan Pursuant to Section 271 of the Communications Act of 1934, as amended, to provide In-Region, InterLATA Services in Michigan (CC Docket No. 97-1), ¶ 22 (February 7, 1997) ("Feb. 7 Order"), quoting Procedures For Bell Operating Company Applications Under New Section 271 Of The Communications Act, Public Notice at 2, FCC 96-469 (rel. Dec. 6, 1996) ("Public Notice") (emphasis supplied by Commission in Feb. 7 Order); see also Application by Ameritech Michigan Pursuant to Section 271 of the Communications Act of 1934, as amended, to provide In-Region, InterLATA Services in Michigan, CC Docket No. 97-137, Memorandum Opinion and Order, FCC 97-298 (rel. Aug. 19, 1997) ("Ameritech Michigan Order") ¶¶ 49-59; Application of BellSouth Corporation, et al. Pursuant to Section 271 of the Communications Act of 1934, as amended, to Provide In-Region, InterLATA Services in South Carolina, CC Docket No. 97-208, Memorandum Opinion and Order, FCC 97-418 (rel. Dec. 24, 1997) ("South Carolina Order") ¶¶ 39-45.

inaccurate and immaterial, and, in all events, would not cure BellSouth's failure to demonstrate compliance with the competitive checklist. Yet, as the Commission recognized in both the Ameritech Michigan Order and the South Carolina Order, under the expedited procedures governing section 271 applications, commenters do not have the practical ability to respond to evidence presented for the first time in the applicant's reply comments. Allowing the applicant to introduce new information at the reply comment phase thus is unfair to "other parties," because it denies them a fair opportunity to respond to the information, and encourages applicants to "'game the system.'" Ameritech Michigan Order ¶ 52 (citation omitted); South Carolina Order ¶ 45.

To avoid this problem here and -- equally important -- to deter future noncompliance with the Commission's rules, AT&T respectfully requests that the Commission strike BellSouth's improper material from the record. In the alternative, the Commission should disregard such material.

Mik C. Rosenblum/mg#

Mark C. Rosenblum Roy E. Hoffinger Stephen C. Garavito

Its Attorneys

AT&T Corp. 295 North Maple Ave. Basking Ridge, NJ 07920 (908) 221-3539

Dated: September 17, 1998

Respectfully submitted,

Haddad/myt Mark E. Haddad Michael J. Hunseder Sidley & Austin 1722 Eye Street, N.W. Washington, D.C. 20006

(202) 736-8000

Counsel for AT&T Corp.

EXHIBIT 1

LIST OF BELLSOUTH'S EVIDENCE SUBMITTED IN VIOLATION OF THE COMMISSION'S RULES THAT THE COMMISSION SHOULD STRIKE

Reply Brief:

- p. 23 (evidence of availability of CSRs after July 9th)
- p. 32 (evidence of business rules that were provided after July 9th)
- p. 34 (separation of EDI flow-through data; performance data for June and July that is not directly responsive)
- pp. 40, 67 (evidence of ADUF post-dating July 9th)
- pp. 56-58 (newly raised takings claim)
- p. 65 (performance data on cutover post-dating July 9th)
- pp. 82-83 (evidence and argument regarding resale restrictions that BellSouth should have anticipated and filed with original application)
- p. 87 (data on performance measures that post-date July 9th)

Milner Reply Aff.:

¶ 19 (performance data on loop cutovers post-dating July 9th)

Stacy Reply OSS Aff.:

- ¶ 26 (evidence of availability of CSRs after July 9th)
- ¶ 42 (evidence of business rules that were provided after July 9th)
- ¶¶ 62-64 (separation of EDI flow-through data that BellSouth should have anticipated and filed with original application; reconfiguration of flow-through data on reply; performance data for June and July that is not directly responsive)

Stacy Reply PM Aff.:

¶ 21 (explanation of CLEC errors that BellSouth should have anticipated and filed with original application; reconfiguration of flow-through data on reply; performance data for June and July that is not directly responsive)

Exhs. WNSPM Reply 4a-4e (reconfiguration of flow-through data on reply; performance data for June and July that is not directly responsive)

Exhs. WNSPM Reply 5a, 5b (explanation of CLEC errors that BellSouth should have anticipated and filed with original application)

Varner Reply Aff.:

¶¶ 50, 51 (evidence and argument regarding resale restrictions that BellSouth should have anticipated and filed with original application)

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I, Anisha Anne Abrol, do hereby certify that I caused a copy of the foregoing Motion of AT&T Corp. to Strike Portions of BellSouth's Reply Evidence to be served this 17th day of September, 1998, by First Class mail (except where noted) on all parties on the attached servic list.

And how from April

Janice Myles
Policy and Program Planning Division
FEDERAL COMMUNICATIONS
COMMISSION
1919 M Street, NW
Room 544
Washington, DC 20554

Donald J. Russell
Telecommunications Task Force
Antitrust Division
U.S. DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE
1401 H Street, NW
Suite 800
Washington, DC 20005

ITS, Inc. 1231 20th Street, NW Washington, DC 20036

Lawrence C. St. Blanc Executive Secretary LOUISIANA PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION P.O. Box 91154 Baton Rouge, LA 70821-9154

Joel Klein U.S. DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE 950 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW Washington, DC 20530-001

James G. Harralson*
28 Perimeter Center East
Atlanta, GA 30346
Counsel for BellSouth Long Distance

Charles R. Morgan*
William B. Barfield
Jim O. Llewellyn
1155 Peachtree Street, NE
Atlanta, GA 30367

David G. Frolio**
1133 21st Street, NW
Washington, DC 20036

Erwin G. Krasnow**
VERNER, LIIPFERT, BERNHARD,
McPHERSON & HAND
901 15th Street, NW
Washington, DC 20005
Counsel for BellSouth Corporation

Michael K. Kellogg**
Austin C. Schlick
William B. Peterson
KELLOGG, HUBER, HANSEN, TODD
& EVANS
Suite 1000 West
1301 K Street, NW
Washington, DC 20005
Counsel for BellSouth Corporation,
BellSouth Telecommunications, Inc., and
BellSouth Long Distance, Inc.

Jennings Bryant
Donald Vial
ALLIANCE FOR PUBLIC
TECHNOLOGY
901 15th Street, NW
Suite 230
Washington, DC 20005

Margaret H. Greene*
R. Douglas Lackey
Stephen M. Klimacek
675 W. Peachtree Street, NE
Suite 4300
Atlanta, GA 30375
Counsel for BellSouth
Telecommunications

Sheldon Elliot Steinbach AMERICAN COUNCIL ON EDUCATION One Dupont Circle, NW Washington, DC 20036

Kelly R. Welsh
John T. Lenahan
Gary L. Phillips
AMERITECH CORPORATION
30 South Wacker Drive
Chicago, IL 60606

Theodore A. Livingston
John E. Muench
Dennis G. Friedman
Christian F. Binnig
MAYER, BROWN & PLATT
190 South LaSalle Street
Chicago, IL 60603

Richard J. Metzger
Emily M. Williams
ASSOCIATION FOR LOCAL
TELECOMMUNCATIONS SERVICES
888 17th Street, NW
Suite 900
Washington, DC 20006

Ronald Binz
Debra Berlyn
John Windhausen, Jr.
COMPETITION POLICY INSTITUTE
1156 15th Street, NW
Suite 520
Washington, DC 20005

John Windhausen, Jr. 3773 Cherry Creek North Drive Suite 1050 Denver, CO 80209

Genevieve Morelli COMPETITIVE TELECOMMUNICATIONS ASSOC. 1900 M Street, NW Suite 800 Washington, DC 20036 Counsel for Competition Policy Institute

Danny E. Adams
Steven A. Augustino
Melissa M. Smith
KELLEY, DRYE & WARREN
1200 19th Street, NW
Suite 500
Washington, DC 20036
Counsel for Competitive
Telecommunicaitons Association

Brad E. Mutschelknaus
John J. Heitman
KELLEY, DRYE & WARREN
1200 19th Street, NW
Fifth Floor
Washington, DC 20036
Counsel for e.spire Communications

James M. Smith EXCEL COMMUNICATIONS 1133 Connecticut Avenue, NW Suite 750 Washington, DC 20036

Dana Frix
Robert V. Zener
SWIDLER, BERLIN, SHEREFF,
FRIEDMAN
3000 K Street, NW
Suite 300
Washington, DC 20007
Counsel for Excel Communications

Janet S. Livengood HYPERION DDI Plaza Two 500 Thomas Street Suite 400 Bridgeville, PA 15017-2838

Dana Frix
Douglas G. Bonner
SWIDLER, BERLIN, SHEREFF,
FRIEDMAN
3000 K Street, NW
Suite 300
Washington, DC 20007
Counsel for Hyperion

Jonathan E. Canis
Enrico C. Soriano
KELLEY, DRYE & WARREN
1200 19th Street, NW
Fifth Floor
Washington, DC 20036
Counsel for Intermedia

Angela Ledford KEEP AMERICA CONNECTED P.O. Box 27911 Washington, DC 20005

Camille Failla Murphy NATIONAL ASSOCIATION OF COMMISSIONS FOR WOMEN 8630 Fenton Street Silver Spring, MD 20901

Tomasa C. Rosales NATIONAL HISPANIC COUNCIL ON AGING 2713 Ontario Road, NW Suite 200 Washington, DC 20009

Jordan Clark
UNITED HOMEOWNERS
ASSOCIATION
655 15th Street, NW
Suite 460
Washington, DC 20005

Mary C. Albert SWIDLER, BERLIN, SHEREFF, FRIEDMAN 3000 K Street, NW Suite 300 Washington, DC 20007

Robert E. Litan BROOKINGS INSTITUTE 1775 Massachusetts Avenue, NW Washington, DC 20036 Roger G. Noll Professor of Economics STANFORD UNIVERSITY Stanford, CA 94305

Jerome L. Epstein
Marc A. Goldman
Paul W. Cobb, Jr.
Thomas D. Amrine
Jeffrey I. Ryen
JENNER & BLOCK
601 13th Street, NW
Washington, DC 20005
Counsel for MCI

Mary L. Brown
Keith L. Seat
Karen T. Reidy
MCI TELECOMMUNCATIONS CORP.
1801 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW
Washington, DC 20006

Hamilton E. Russell III STATE COMMUNICATIONS 200 North Main Street Suite 303 Greenville, SC 29601

Dana Frix
Robert V. Zener
SWIDLER, BERLIN, SHEREFF,
FRIEDMAN
3000 K Street, NW
Suite 300
Washington, DC 20007
Counsel for State Communications

Charles C. Hunter
Catherine M. Hannan
HUNTER COMMUNICATIONS LAW
GROUP
1620 I Street, NW
Suite 701
Washington, DC 20006
Counsel for Telecommunications
Resellers Association

Brian Conboy
Thomas Jones
A. Renee Callahan
WILLKIE, FARR & GALLAGHER
Three Lafayette Centre
1155 21st Street, NW
Washington, DC 20036
Counsel for Time Warner
Communications Holdings d/b/a Time
Warner Telecom

Walter L. Purdy
TRIANGLE COALITION FOR
SCIENCE
AND TECHNOLOGY EDUCATION
5112 Berwyn Road
College Park, MD 20740-4129

John L. Traylor US WEST COMMUNICATIONS 1020 19th Street, NW Suite 700 Washington, DC 20036 Catherine R. Sloan Richard L. Fruchterman III Richard S. Whitt WORLDCOM 1120 Connecticut Avenue, NW Washington, DC 20036-3902

Andrew D. Lipman Robert V. Zener SWIDLER, BERLIN, SHEREFF, FRIEDMAN 3000 K Street, NW Suite 300 Washington, DC 20007 Counsel for WorldCom

Laura H. Phillips
J.G. Harrington
Cecile G. Neuvens
DOW, LOHNES & ALBERTSON
1200 New Hampshire Avenue, NW
Suite 800
Washington, DC 20036-6802
Counsel for Cox Communications

Kim Robert Scovill OMNICALL 430 Woodruff Road Suite 450 Greenville, SC 29607

Leon M. Kestenbaum SPRINT COMMUNICATIONS CO. 1850 M Street, NW Washington, DC 20036 Robert L. Hoggarth
Angela E. Giancarlo
PAGING AND MESSAGING
ALLIANCE
OF THE PERSONAL
COMMUNICATIONS
INDUSTRY ASSOCIATION
500 Montgomery Street
Suite 700
Alexandria, VA 22314-1561

Harold Mordkofsky
Susan J. Bahr
BLOOSTON, MORDKOFSKY,
JACKSON &
DICKENS
2120 L Street, NW
Suite 300
Washignton, DC 20037

Philip L. Verveer
Sue D. Blumenfeld
Thomas Jones
Gunnar Halley
Jay Angelo
Sophie Keefer
WILLKIE, FARR & GALLAGHER
Three Lafayette Centre
1155 21st Street, NW
Washington, DC 20036

^{*}via facsimile and federal express

^{**}via hand delivery